

**San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking
And Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children
Advisory Council Report**

To the

San Diego County Board of Supervisors

October 2014

Executive Summary

San Diego County Board of Supervisors charge to the newly formed San Diego Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council issued June 2011: *“The goal of the Advisory Council is to implement a holistic, countywide approach integrating the Four P’s Model of the U.S. Department of Justice: Prevention, Protection, Prosecution and Partnerships. It will focus on identifying best practices and promising trends addressing the root causes of trafficking and exploitation, advance public policy, standardize training and protocols, and enhance victim services by creating an optimized, seamless service delivery system.”*

San Diego County was among the first regions nationwide to respond to human trafficking, and has set a high standard for collaboratively combating human trafficking. However, our work is far from done. Many victims of labor and sex trafficking surface every year, requiring immediate and sustained assistance and services. On January 24th, 2014, the Advisory Council hosted a county-wide human trafficking summit—**“Combating Human Trafficking in San Diego County – Best Practices for Today and Tomorrow: A summit coordinated by the San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council”**—and brought together key stakeholders to identify gaps and to discuss best practices in victim services, child welfare, community, prosecution, education, training, law enforcement, and research. Since the Summit, the San Diego County Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council has been working to process all of the recommendations. This report identifies the top recommendations coming out of the Summit as determined by the Advisory Council’s Sub-Committees.

The Summit and this report were made possible with the support, funding, and time of many individuals and agencies. We would like to thank the U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Community Oriented Policing Services for the grant that enabled us to host the Summit and fund this report. We would also like to thank Point Loma Nazarene University for hosting and staffing the summit pro bono. We are indebted to Jim and Colleen Copple, and all of the Strategic Applications International staff, for their dedication, work, and encouragement throughout this process. Most importantly, we would like to thank Supervisor Dianne Jacob, District Attorney Bonnie Dumanis, and Sheriff Bill Gore for their creation of and support for the Advisory Council, the Summit, and this report; your steadfast commitment to combat trafficking has enabled San Diego County to maximize effectiveness, collaboratively fight trafficking, and aid survivors.

Jenée Littrell, Chair
Vice Principal
Chaparral High School

Mary-Ellen S. Barrett, Vice Chair
Deputy District Attorney
San Diego County District Attorney’s Office

Table of Contents

Executive Summary.....	2
Table of Contents.....	3
An Overview of Human Trafficking in San Diego County.....	4
San Diego County’s Response to Human Trafficking.....	5
The San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council.....	6
Law Enforcement Recommendations.....	7
Prosecution Recommendations.....	9
Victim Services Recommendations.....	12
Child Welfare Services Recommendations.....	14
Education Recommendations.....	15
Community Recommendations.....	16
Research and Data Recommendations.....	18
Appendix A: Summit Action Planning and Recommendations Process.....	21
Appendix B: San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and CSEC Advisory Council Members and Sub-Committee Chairs	22

An Overview of Human Trafficking in San Diego County

A variety of forms of human trafficking have been documented in San Diego County: sex and labor trafficking, trafficking of children and adults, domestic and international trafficking.

The San Diego District Attorney's Office provides the following definitions of human trafficking:

- “Sex trafficking is the exploitation of a person by means including coercion or deceit to engage in commercial sexual activity, prostitution, exotic dancing, or pornography. (When the victim is a minor under the age of 18 years old, sex trafficking does not require force or coercion. Minors cannot legally consent to sexual activity).
- “Labor trafficking is the exploitation of a person by means including coercion or deceit for labor services. Labor trafficking victims are often forced into domestic servitude, construction, restaurant, agricultural, massage parlors, or sweatshop factory work with little or no pay.”¹

The California Legislature defines human trafficking as all acts involved in the recruitment, abduction, transport, harboring, transfer, sale or receipt of persons, within national or across international borders, through force, coercion, fraud or deception, to place persons in situations of slavery or slavery-like conditions, forced labor or services, such as forced prostitution or sexual services, domestic servitude, bonded sweatshop labor, or other debt bondage.

The 4 Ps model outlined by the U.S. Department of Justice that the Advisory Council was asked to pursue is more fully defined as follows:

Prevention efforts are a key component of the movement to monitor and combat human trafficking. Prevention activities come in many forms. Public awareness campaigns inform and educate communities in source and destination locales about human trafficking so that they can identify victims and warn migrants and other vulnerable populations. Prevention also encapsulates cross-cutting endeavors that include: strengthening laws, increasing education of professionals and potential victims and addressing the demand side.

The effort to prevent human trafficking is closely intertwined with protection and prosecution measures. Effective law enforcement and protection practices are essential to ensuring stronger prevention policies, which can deter the occurrence of human trafficking.

Protection is essential to the victim-centered approach. Key victim protection efforts include identification, rescue, rehabilitation, and reintegration. Victim identification measures are integral in implementing the victim-centered approach. Proactively

¹ United States of America. San Diego County District Attorney's Office. *Human Trafficking*. Web. 11 Sept. 2014. <www.FightHumanTraffickingSD.com>.

identifying victims and training first responders are of paramount importance to the ability to tackle human trafficking.

Prioritizing the rights and needs of victims provides a roadmap that goes beyond the initial rescue, restores survivors' dignity, and provides an opportunity for productive lives. Government and Non-Governmental Organizations must work to enhance victim protection in every area.

Prosecution of traffickers is the third element of the paradigm by which to pursue this shadowy crime. It requires specialized prosecution with an emphasis on a victim-centered approach and holding the perpetrators accountable.

Partnerships, is the fourth and final "P" in combating human trafficking require the expertise, resources and efforts of many individuals and entities. It is a complex, multi-faceted issue requiring a comprehensive response of government and nongovernment entities in such areas as human rights, labor and employment, health and services, and law enforcement. It requires partnerships among all of these entities to have a meaningful impact on this crime.

Categorizing human trafficking can be challenging. Victims of sex trafficking may become victims of labor trafficking, and vice versa. Undocumented labor practices may be a gateway to labor trafficking, just as pornography and stripping can be a gateway to sex trafficking. Fundamentally, human trafficking is modern-day slavery and a human rights violation: a violation of the right to be free. Furthermore, it is a crime by federal and California state law—which mandates that we respond.

Given the illicit nature of trafficking, identifying the number of traffickers and victims is challenging; however, the FBI classified San Diego as a "High Intensity Child Prostitution Area" in 2009.² Various forms of sex trafficking occur throughout the county. "Every area has its problems," explains a law enforcement officer: 'high end' brothels are found tucked away in expensive neighborhoods, and immigrant women are trafficked within their communities to 'service' migrant field workers.³ However, sex trafficking is most prevalent near: "...El Cajon Boulevard (primarily west of Interstate 15) and National City, with additional pockets of concentrated activity occurring in areas of Oceanside and El Cajon."⁴ Current trends in sex trafficking in San Diego County include: gang-related trafficking, internet-facilitation of trafficking and commercial sexual transactions within hotels (as opposed to streets).⁵ In a recent study on San Diego

² United States of America. Department of Health and Human Services. Office of the Inspector General. *The Federal Bureau of Investigation's Efforts to Combat Crimes Against Children*. 2009. Web.

³ "San Diego County Law Enforcement Interviews on Human Trafficking." Personal interview. 3 Sept. 2013.

⁴ San Diego Association of Governments. Criminal Justice Research Division. *Child and Youth Sexual Exploitation in the San Diego Region: A Community Assessment for the ACTION Network*. By Cynthia Burke, Debbie Correia, Sylvia J. Sievers, and Sandy Keaton. N.p., May 2007. (p. 6)

⁵ "San Diego County Law Enforcement Interviews on Human Trafficking." Personal interview. 3 Sept. 2013.

and seven other cities, the Urban Institute noted that profit from the ‘underground commercial sex economy’ is on par with narcotics sales.⁶

As a border community, labor trafficking is unsurprisingly present. In a 2012 report for the Department of Justice, San Diego State University’s Dr. Sheldon Zhang asserted: “...we estimate that there are 38,458 are victims of labor trafficking violations in San Diego County.”⁷ In the California Attorney General’s report, “The State of Human Trafficking in California, 2012,” the scope of labor trafficking extends to, “...forced labor in underground markets and sweatshops, as well as legitimate businesses such as hotels, factories, restaurants, construction sites, farming, landscaping, nail salons, and traveling sales crews.”⁸ Professions with the most labor trafficking cases in San Diego County include (in decreasing order of prevalence): construction, janitorial services, landscaping, and agriculture.⁹ Domestic servitude is another known form of labor trafficking in San Diego County; however the prevalence of domestic servitude is unknown.

San Diego County’s Response to Human Trafficking

San Diego County was among the first communities nationwide to respond to human trafficking, and has set a high standard for collaboratively combating human trafficking. Upwards of 50 victim services providers offer care and support to trafficking survivors; this includes 14 beds designated specifically for adult, female survivors of human trafficking in shelters. A variety of community organizations work to raise awareness about human trafficking and provide support for victim services.

Collaborative groups have formed to address trafficking in-county. The Bilateral Safety Corridor Coalition was one of the first anti-trafficking coalitions nationwide, bringing together service providers, law enforcement, local businesses, and community members to look at domestic and international trafficking.¹⁰ The FBI Innocence Lost Task Force was formed in 2003. Sixteen local and federal law enforcement agencies formed the San Diego Regional Anti-Trafficking Task Force and the North County Anti-Trafficking Task Force in 2004 and 2010 respectively. The North County Human Trafficking Task Force is funded through June 2015, at which time the Task Force will be forced to shut down, unless new funding can be obtained. The San Diego Anti-Trafficking Task Force lost its grant and has ceased to exist.

⁶ Dank, Meredith, Bilal Khan, P. Mitchell Downey, Cybele Kotonias, Deborah Mayer, Colleen Owens, Laura Pacifici, and Lilly Yu. *Estimating the Size and Structure of the Underground Commercial Sex Economy in Eight Major US Cities*. Rep. Urban Institute, Mar. 2014. Web. 11 Sept. 2014.

⁷ Zhang, Sheldon X. *Looking for a Hidden Population: Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County*. Rep. San Diego State University, Nov. 2012. Web. 16 July 2013. (p.17)

⁸ United States of America. California Department of Justice. Office of the Attorney General. *The State of Human Trafficking in California, 2012*. By Kamala Harris. N.p., 16 Nov. 2012. Web. (p. 15-16)

⁹ Zhang, Sheldon X. *Looking for a Hidden Population: Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County*. Rep. San Diego State University, Nov. 2012. Web. 16 July 2013. (p.12)

¹⁰ Larson, Thomas. "Reina's Story." *San Diego Reader*. San Diego Reader, 7 Aug. 2003. Web. 11 Sept. 2014.

In 2003, District Attorney Bonnie Dumanis formed the Sex Crimes and Human Trafficking Division with specialized prosecutors, investigators, and victim advocates.¹¹ The Division expanded from its central location to serve the East, North and South Branches in our County in order to more effectively prosecute human trafficking. In March, 2014, San Diego County DA's office was featured as one of three best practices offices in the State in a statewide symposium by the WYCA and the CA Attorney General.

Several churches have collectively formed Churches Against Trafficking, which meets monthly to identify how they can support existing anti-trafficking efforts throughout the county. Other anti-trafficking collaborative and working groups include the FBI Innocence Lost Task Force, and the San Diego Association of Governments.

The Global Oversight Analysis Linking Systems (GOALS) Memorandum Of Understanding (MOU) has united a number of agencies in addressing the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC). Under the legal guidance of Dr. Bernard James, agencies in East County created the GOALS MOU to enable information-sharing between the agencies in order to facilitate and improve the identification and treatment of CSEC victims. These East County agencies were so successful that the GOALS MOU has been expanded countywide, and is being emulated nationally. Around 20 agencies have signed onto the GOALS MOU; these agencies are organized into Local Management Advisory Teams for local implementation and coordination.

The San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council:

The San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council has become a leader in San Diego County's anti-trafficking work since its establishment in 2011. The Advisory Council was created to 'compliment' the work of existing agencies and collaborative groups; it was intended, "...to serve as a catalyst toward comprehensive, systemic change addressing human trafficking and CSEC at a county-wide, interdisciplinary level."¹² The Advisory Council is comprised of several sub-committees, representing the various sectors that work with survivors of trafficking; the current sub-committees are: Community, Education, Law Enforcement, Prosecution, Research, Victim Services, and Child Welfare. Sub-committees meet monthly, and are open to the respective sector. All sub-committee chairs meet monthly for a coordinating meeting overseen by the Executive Committee. The Executive Committee reports directly to the County Board of Supervisors, the District Attorney, and the Sheriff.

Supervisor Dianne Jacob, District Attorney Bonnie Dumanis, and Sheriff Bill Gore were instrumental in the formation of the Advisory Council. From its inception, Supervisor Jacob, DA Dumanis, and Sheriff Gore tasked the Advisory Council with identifying best practices in anti-trafficking and with recommending countywide anti-trafficking policies.

¹¹ Note: The division was originally named 'Sex Crimes and Stalking,' but that name was changed in 2013 to reflect the increase in human trafficking prosecutions.

¹² San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council. San Diego County Board of Supervisors. *Action Statement*. 2011.

A Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS) Office grant from the Department of Justice awarded to Strategic Applications International (SAI) enabled the Advisory Council to hire a coordinator and to fund the recent summit: “Combating Human Trafficking—Best Practices for Today and Tomorrow: *A summit coordinated by the San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children Advisory Council.*” The summit was an outgrowth of the collaborative meetings and strategic planning already in process since 2011 through the Advisory Council. The Advisory Council identified a summit as the ideal mechanism by which to bring together all anti-trafficking stakeholders in San Diego County in order to identify best practices and to create recommendations for countywide policy, in compliance with the Advisory Council’s mandate. This report is intended to convey the summit participants’ and Advisory Council’s top recommendations to the County Board of Supervisors, District Attorney, and Sheriff.

Law Enforcement Recommendations

- 1. Create a San Diego County regional and centralized Human Trafficking Task Force to focus primarily on the investigation of human trafficking and related crimes.**
 - a. Task Force should seek participation from local, state, and federal law enforcement and prosecution agencies, including the following: Federal Bureau of Investigation, ICE Homeland Security, Department of Justice, Assistant U.S. Attorney(s), San Diego County Sheriff's Department, Deputy District Attorney(s), Deputy City Attorney(s), San Diego Police Department, and Probation.
 - b. Task Force should work with qualified victim service providers consistent with the needs of the victim for counseling, shelter, relocation, court support, medical care, etc.
 - c. Task Force should coordinate with the appropriate multi-disciplinary team members as appropriate for the needs of the victim and the case such as: social welfare services, probation, health, and education.
 - d. Task Force should develop protocols for interagency communication to facilitate appropriate information-sharing.
 - e. Task Force should develop protocols to effectively investigate all human trafficking cases, including sex and labor trafficking, utilizing a victim-centered approach.
 - f. Task Force members should be housed in a central location in order to maximize resources and intelligence sharing.
 - g. Task Force should utilize qualified analysts to enhance the use of evidence-based models for a more effectual investigation and prosecution.
 - h. Task Force should explore and identify sustainable funding sources.
- 2. Increase, update, and standardize comprehensive training on all aspects of human trafficking to law enforcement, other first responders, prosecutors, and justice partners.**
 - a. Increase, update, and implement consistent training in all Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) certified and non-POST certified law enforcement and first responder academies with a focus on the detection of human trafficking that may be hiding in plain sight during routine law enforcement contacts.
 - b. Expand training on employing the most effective victim-centered approaches to victim and witness interviews at all stages of investigations and proceedings.
 - c. Educate on the high potential for trauma and PTSD in victims of human trafficking, and how to avoid increasing it in the investigative process utilizing a trauma-informed approach.
 - d. Create a process for ongoing training appropriate for all segments, experience, and leadership levels of law enforcement and other justice partners.
 - e. Create a current and user-friendly resource guide to assist law enforcement, first responders, prosecutors, and other justice partners.

- 3. Create a centralized data bank that documents perpetrators and defendants of human trafficking and its related crimes.**
 - a. Create a countywide centralized data bank that tracks and documents perpetrators and defendants of human trafficking and their network of associates similar to Cal Gangs.
 - b. Encourage efforts for statewide implementation of the recommendation by the California Department of Justice to gather comprehensive human trafficking information including utilizing California's fusion center system.
- 4. Develop methods to evaluate the effectiveness of law enforcement efforts in combating human trafficking.**
 - a. Continually review statistical information from a multidisciplinary approach to evaluate the effectiveness of law enforcement's investigative methods.
 - b. Utilize evidence-based research to adjust law enforcement's approach, response, and training as needed, based on the current and emerging human trafficking intelligence.

Prosecution Recommendations

- 1. Create a San Diego County regional and centralized Human Trafficking Task Force to focus primarily on the investigation of human trafficking and related crimes in order to advance the “Prosecution” of all forms of Human Trafficking.**
 - a. Task Force should seek participation from local, state, and federal law enforcement and prosecution agencies, including but not limited to: San Diego County Sheriff’s Department, Probation, Deputy District Attorney(s), Deputy City Attorney(s), Assistant U.S. Attorneys, Department of Justice, San Diego Police Department, Department of Justice Bureau of Investigations, Federal Bureau of Investigations, and ICE Homeland Security.
 - b. Task Force should work with qualified victim service providers consistent with the needs of the victim for counseling, shelter, relocation, court support, medical care, etc.
 - c. Task Force should coordinate with the appropriate multi-disciplinary team members as appropriate for the needs of the victim and the case such as: social welfare services, probation, health, and education.
 - d. Task Force should develop protocols for interagency communication to facilitate appropriate information-sharing with agencies to include: San Diego City Attorney’s Office, Probation, and Parole.
 - e. Task Force should develop protocols to effectively investigate sex and labor trafficking cases utilizing a victim-centered and trauma-informed approach.
 - f. Task Force members should be housed in a central location in order to maximize resources and intelligence sharing.
 - g. Task Force should utilize qualified analysts to enhance the use of evidence-based models for more effective law enforcement and prosecution.
 - h. Task Force should explore funding sources including but not limited to: federal and state grants and county-sustainable funding.
- 2. Increase, update, and standardize comprehensive training on all aspects of human trafficking to law enforcement, first responders, prosecutors, and justice partners in order to advance the “Protection, Prosecution, Prevention, and Partnerships” to effectively combat human trafficking.**
 - a. Increase, update, and implement consistent training in all law enforcement and first responder academies with a focus on the detection of human trafficking that may be hiding in plain sight during routine law enforcement contacts.
 - b. Expand training on employing the most effective victim-centered approaches to victim and witness interviews at all stages of investigations cases or court proceedings.
 - c. Educate on the high potential for trauma and PTSD in victims of human trafficking, and how to avoid increasing it in the investigative process utilizing a trauma informed approach.

- d. Create a process for ongoing training appropriate for all segments, experience, and leadership levels of law enforcement and other justice partners.
 - e. Create a current and user-friendly resource guide to assist law enforcement, first responders, prosecutors, and other justice partners
 - f. Expand training for vertical and specialized prosecution and DA victim services of human trafficking cases.
- 3. Strengthen laws and tools to address the demand side of human trafficking, recognizing that the profit from the demand fuels the crime in order to advance the “Prevention” and “Protection” aspects.**
- a. Encourage laws with stricter penalties for demand side perpetrators.
 - b. Support the provision of resources, tools, and laws for enforcement and prosecution of demand side perpetrators.
 - c. Utilize media campaigns and community education to change the social acceptability of the demand side culture, emphasizing sexual and labor exploitation is not a victimless crime.
 - d. Implement and enforce the requirement that certain locations including but not limited to adult businesses, airports, and buses post the National Human Trafficking Resource Center hotline, and support legislative efforts to expand the requirement as appropriate to additional establishments such as hotels and motels.
- 4. Implement effective strategies to increase victim identification in order to advance the “4 P’s” of combating human trafficking.**
- a. Review the handling of potential victims of human trafficking who are in our court system as perpetrators of prostitution and related crimes and the viability of diversion and human trafficking courts similar to Drug Court, Veterans Court, and Behavioral Health Courts with a multi-disciplinary team approach.
 - b. Expand public awareness campaigns that assist victims in self-identifying and reporting to law enforcement or seeking other services.
 - c. Utilize best practices learned from the child abuse, sexual assault, and domestic violence areas that share common features with human trafficking, such as: forensic interviews of child and teen victims, Sexual Assault Response Team model, and a forensic or other medical examination as appropriate.
- 5. Partner with schools and afterschool programs to provide a systematic approach to the prevention of victimization and the intervention in victimization in order to advance “Prevention,” and build “Partnerships.”**
- a. Support legislation or systems that will add education on human trafficking and exploitation to sex education curriculum or other curriculum at no later than Junior High School.
 - i. In the absence of legislation, get buy-in from school districts to provide this prevention education as part of the curriculum.
 - ii. Adopt the Grossmont model for intervention by educating teachers and schools and creating a systematic method of identifying, intervening, and interrupting victimization.

- b. Include afterschool programs as a key area of prevention and intervention, such as Boys and Girls Clubs.
 - c. Include the potential of human trafficking in the truancy reporting system.
 - d. Simplify appropriate information-sharing between partners.
 - e. Create social media and other tools that include appropriate test target audience to dispel the myths about the “pimp” and victim lifestyle—use schools as an easy avenue for the distribution of the message.
 - f. Provide expertise for training school medical providers, especially school nurses, to detect, report, and rescue potential victims of human trafficking. School nurses are a key professional in the life of school children and learn critical information that can lead to proper intervention in the life of a young victim.
- 6. Implement a multi-disciplinary response team and protocol specific to sexually based human trafficking of minors in order to advance the “4 P’s” model for effectively combating human trafficking.**
- a. Multi-disciplinary response protocols should be further implemented to effectively address sexual exploitation of minors to leverage law enforcement, social services, medical treatment, psychological treatment, education, and probation and court where indicated—this would include the utilization of forensic interviews where appropriate for the age and mental capacity of the minor, and sexual assault response team medical examination, rape kit, and examination for and treatment of sexually transmitted diseases.
 - b. Providing short-term safe homes and long-term residential housing and treatment for sexually exploited minors.
 - c. Establishing a protocol for mandatory reporting of CSEC whether it arises in the context of school, social services, police contacts, or medical contacts

(Note that multi-disciplinary response teams may be useful in adult sex trafficking and labor trafficking, but are more readily available and feasible in the sex trafficking of minors due to intersections with child welfare, schools, and truancy.)

Victim Services Recommendations

1. Expand Services for Survivors.

- a. Increase public and private funding and awareness to expand comprehensive services addressing human trafficking.
- b. Create comprehensive, family-centered services for survivors (e.g. case plan, parent education, and support). Necessary services include: legal, medical, dental, psychiatric, optometry, ID obtainment, counseling, education, court support, tattoo removal, child care, job readiness, case management, transportation, and transition to independence.
- c. Create a structured system and action plan for emergency, short-term, and long-term care.
- d. Develop minor-specific residential rehabilitation including non-adjudicated CSEC victims.
- e. Increase fines for “johns” and traffickers with a percentage of funds dedicated to victim services.

2. Expand Housing for Survivors.

- a. Secure funding to allow existing NGOs and Community Service Organizations (CSOs) to expand services to provide more housing for survivors of human trafficking.
- b. Allocate existing beds in shelters for human trafficking survivors and standardize procedures and protocols.
- c. Expand emergency (2-3 day stay to include medical and psychological evaluation), short-term and long-term housing availability for minors, adults and adults or minors with children.
- d. Increase fines for “johns” and traffickers with a percentage of funds dedicated to providing housing to survivors.

3. Develop an organizational alliance between victim services workers and law enforcement to form a countywide multi-disciplinary Human Trafficking Response Team (HTRT) to work with survivors from rescue (or arrest) through treatment.

- a. Focus on the demand side of human trafficking.
- b. Consult other jurisdictions that have already established an HTRT, including Cook County Illinois and Tri-County Florida, along with SART San Diego.
- c. Provide a victim advocate or trained human trafficking survivor to respond with law enforcement at initial contact to improve identification and engagement of survivors.
- d. The HTRT should include survivors, court liaisons, mental health providers, addiction specialists, health services providers, caseworkers, and law enforcement.

4. Centralize human trafficking case management in a single location (i.e. Human Trafficking Resource Center) modeled after the Family Justice Center.

- a. Coordinate emergency housing, medical evaluation, and psychological evaluation of victims upon arrival.

- b. Provide the following services: case management, legal assistance, court support, counseling, education, job readiness and training, child care, “dress for success”, and referrals for medical, dental, psychiatry, optometry, and tattoo removal.
 - c. Collaboration with law enforcement, prosecutors, and public defenders.
- 5. Develop partnerships with the Research and Data Sub-Committee to improve the identification and implementation of best practices and to create a document on the latest findings.**
 - 6. Create protocols and best practices that permit service providers to become subcontractors for Probation, Child Welfare Services, and the courts.**
 - 7. Create more transparency and accountability in victim services operations.**
 - 8. Review policies for human trafficking hotlines.**
 - 9. Develop a program design for family practitioners that includes peer-to-peer mentoring.**

Child Welfare Recommendations

1. **Develop a formal protocol for CSEC victims.**
 - a. Implement a universal screening tool for service delivery, placement decisions, and identification.
 - b. Identify a central point of contact to oversee and coordinate the efforts of Child Welfare Services and collaborate with other stakeholders to meet the needs of CSEC victims.
2. **Expand services and placements for CSEC victims.**
 - a. Provide a letter of support to community service organizations to expand services and placement options for commercially sexually exploited youth.
 - b. Create a multi-disciplinary team to provide timely and appropriate services.
3. **Expand CSEC and human trafficking awareness training.**
 - a. Develop training opportunities for county departments and community partners working with CSEC and human trafficking victims.
 - b. Educate the community on the importance of reporting suspected or known CSEC or human trafficking victims to the Child Abuse and Neglect Hotline.
4. **Collection and sharing of Data.**
 - a. Collect Child Welfare Services data and share across systems to better understand the prevalence of CSEC victims that come to the attention of Child Welfare Services.

Education Recommendations

- 1. Develop human trafficking awareness training (including handouts and resource materials) for all school staff, parents, and students. Expand existing training and response protocols countywide to all schools and districts.**
 - a. Develop training opportunities for all school staff including summits, workshops, in-services, handouts, and resource materials. Ensure that administration and nurses are included in the trainings.
 - b. The Education Sub-Committee may coordinate multi-disciplinary trainings across regions within the county beginning with the 2014-2015 academic year.
 - c. The Education Sub-Committee will maintain a library of handouts and resource materials to be posted on line for equitable access. This library may be housed in a Human Trafficking Resource Center.
- 2. Promote countywide participation in information-sharing among all relevant agencies. Establish procedures for collaboration between school districts and case managers in existing services or other local coalitions with similar missions (i.e. Healthy Start and the Spring Valley Family Coalition).**
 - a. The GOALS Leadership Team and SDCOE will continue to promote the participation of the GOALS MOU across the county with various school districts and agencies.
 - b. Promote systematic-change at the district-level: encourage districts to do adopt new human trafficking policies, not just host trainings.
- 3. Explore age and developmentally appropriate small group prevention and intervention curriculum.**
 - a. The Education Sub-Committee will identify a program (such as PLAYGROUND) to pilot with a small group of students.
 - b. Support the adoption of school district policies that address human trafficking.
 - i. Promote human trafficking being appropriately placed within curriculum.
 - ii. In the absence of legislation, get buy in from school district to provide this prevention education as part of the curriculum.
- 4. Encourage school districts to train all staff including afterschool personnel on human trafficking and CSEC.**
- 5. Collaborate with the other Sub-Committees to develop a standardized and research-informed CSEC training for school personnel that is culturally sensitive, trauma-informed, and inclusive of all victims and survivors.**

Community Recommendations

- 1. Assist San Diego Human Trafficking Task Force and victim service providers in obtaining increased public and private funding.**
 - a. Identify the gaps between the number of cases and available services; determine specific funding needs to close those gaps.
 - b. Lobby for increased and sustained funding for the task force and human trafficking victim service providers.
 - c. Identify private funders (such as individuals, NGOs, foundations, and grants). Engage local banks, businesses, homeowners, and associations to donate homes for the purpose of creating “safe homes” for survivors.
 - d. Establish a collaborative and coordinated approach to grant writing, foundation outreach, and innovative fundraising strategies. Create a team of volunteer grant writers and pay for volunteers to receive professional training (available at SDSU, PLNU, and the San Diego Foundation).
 - e. Coordinate a countywide campaign to introduce service, professional, business, NGO, and community organizations to the current anti-trafficking work of law enforcement, victim services, and NGOs.
- 2. Increase community buy-in to combat trafficking.**
 - a. Maintain a community-wide calendar of events on the San Diego County website.
 - b. Publicize the National Human Trafficking Resource Center National Human Trafficking Resource Center (NHTRC) hotline number on the San Diego County website.
 - c. Identify high profile “champions” for the cause to help build momentum and awareness of current issues (i.e. celebrities, politicians, media personalities, and business and community leaders).
 - d. Provide a platform for survivors to be able to share their testimonies to promote compassion and understanding.
 - e. Promote awareness and disperse hotline numbers utilizing diverse platforms, such as billboards, magazine ad campaigns, or reality TV shows. Use high profile events, such as the Superbowl or award shows, to increase visibility of the issues. For example, continuation and expansion of the current billboard and bus shelter awareness campaigns.
 - f. Increase collaboration with community groups, faith leaders, and local organizations to fully engage them as stakeholders in addressing human trafficking. *(Note: As a result of our efforts to gather community leaders, Churches Against Trafficking was formed in 2013 with eight county churches represented. As of July 2014, over 50 churches are represented and CAT has hosted trainings and poster outreach campaigns. In addition, this model has been replicated in two other California counties.)*
- 3. Provide community training on human trafficking prevention and identification.**
 - a. Host a public announcement campaign to raise awareness among parents and students. This campaign may include: news outlets, billboards, bus

- signs, and school communications; on-campus student groups may promulgate the campaign as well.
- b. Host community forums, PTA meetings, and other civic meetings joining teenagers and parents to address the needs that lead to vulnerability. Empower teenagers to be a part of the solution through peer-to-peer education programs, and by providing safe, confidential means of reporting.
 - c. Develop IT safety awareness and training to educate children, teens, parents and the broader community.
 - d. Structure initiatives to encourage male involvement and peer-to-peer education to reduce sex trafficking.
 - e. Provide awareness and preventative education for at-risk populations, such as foster youth, gang-vulnerable youth, and migrant and immigrant families, on their legal rights and services.
 - f. Develop culturally sensitive materials for undocumented citizens and underserved populations.
- 4. Create a Human Trafficking Volunteer Corps. Recruit volunteers to help build awareness initiatives, improve access to services, and develop or sustain quality recovery programs for survivors.**
- a. Host ‘train the trainer’ workshops for speakers, student leaders, and student groups in order to facilitate consistent and quality human trafficking presentations.
 - b. Develop training and education opportunities for community-based organizations on how to advocate for services for at-risk youth.
- 5. Address the demand and distribution side of commercial sexual exploitation.**
- a. Enforce current laws against the purchasers of sex and publish their names on public crimes list.
 - b. Sponsor and support legislation that would increase penalties for buyers of sex similar to DUI (i.e. mandatory jail time and education, increased fines, and crime publication).
 - c. Explore reintegration and recidivism-prevention options for traffickers and sex purchasers using best evidence-informed practices. Consider models of peer-led programs.
- 6. Utilize a multi-media campaign to promote more positive imagery of women to help reduce exploitation, confront the glamorization of violence, and address the demand side. This campaign may include:**
- a. Billboards and Transit Signs
 - b. News Articles (in print and/or online)
 - c. Social Media (recognizing positive role models and champions)
 - d. Public Service Announcements.

Research and Data Recommendations

HT-RADAR (San Diego Human Trafficking Research and Data Advisory Roundtable) is an informal gathering of the researchers in the San Diego/Tijuana area that have research skills and interests related to human trafficking. HT-RADAR is designed to build a collaborative research environment around human trafficking in San Diego/Tijuana with the following aims:

1. To plan strategically across disciplines and universities;
2. To share data and data sources;
3. To increase research funding for participating members;
4. To impact the region with research related to human trafficking; and to
5. Implement ongoing research (i.e. descriptive, exploratory, and outcome) related to victims, perpetrators, and consumers of human trafficking (including sex and labor trafficking).

We encourage leaders in the County of San Diego to support HT-RADAR in the following ways:

- 1. Empower the Human Trafficking Research and Data Advisory Round Table (HT-RADAR) as a centralized clearinghouse for human trafficking related research in the San Diego/Tijuana region.**
 - a. Base HT-RADAR at Point Loma Nazarene University as the leader of a regional coalition of interested universities, law enforcement, and community-based researchers.
 - b. Fund an administrator and/or administrative assistance to support the logistics of organizing HT-RADAR, funded perhaps as a private-public partnership.
 - c. Empower HT-RADAR to set its research agenda in coordination with active Advisory Council members and partners.
 - d. Provide avenues for HT-RADAR to appropriately disseminate its research and recommendations to the Advisory Council, relevant agencies, funders, and the public. HT-RADAR could offer research-based consultation (e.g. for media campaigns and human trafficking training programs among public schools).
 - e. Develop a *Research Brief* to be disseminated (quarterly) regarding findings. *Research Brief* to be no more than 2 pages (sent out in PDF format) capturing kernels of the research findings and announcing new research projects.
- 2. Empower and assist HT-RADAR to improve regional human trafficking-related data access and data collection methods so that results are more reliable and valid, with a goal toward more effective impacts on the community.**
- 3. Support an annual Human Trafficking Research Summit focused on reporting to all interested parties the latest findings of human trafficking-related research.**
 - a. While HT-RADAR will meet quarterly to engage in the purposes stated above, researchers and all engaged against human trafficking would benefit from a public annual update on the state of human trafficking related research for the San Diego/Tijuana region.
 - b. Goals of the annual summit will include:

- i. Sharing progress on active research projects;
 - ii. Identifying gaps in the research;
 - iii. Identifying trends;
 - iv. Producing an annual report; and
 - v. Establishing a collective body of research data (on both victims and perpetrators).
 - c. Leverage funds for this summit from participating universities, participants, public funds, foundation grants, etc.
- 4. Support the creation of a Human Trafficking Research Institute for undergraduate and graduate researchers to help develop the next generation to engage against trafficking.**
 - a. Host the Institute at SDSU, the key Minority Serving Institution in town with the capacity to manage the programming. Other universities will collaborate.
 - b. HT-RADAR will coordinate mentoring of younger scholars by experienced researchers across multiple disciplines
 - c. Identify and support applications for research funding from sources such as the National Science Foundation, National Institute for Justice, Humanity United, Qualcomm Foundation, the San Diego Foundation, etc.
- 5. Assist HT-RADAR to create and host a database of regional persons and institutions working against trafficking as a communal resource.**
- 6. Examples of the type of research topics HT-RADAR could encourage include:**
 - a. Develop an evidence-based, standardized method of collecting data, and create a standardized method of interview format (for victims, perpetrators, and consumers) based on gender and age groups.
 - b. Measure the magnitude, nature, reach, and impact of the problem.
 - c. Estimate the monetary cost to society of the arrest of victims versus the arrest of traffickers (e.g. the arrest of one trafficker can save 25 victims).
 - d. Develop a victim profile in order to better prevent and identify victimization. Identify risk and protective factors including pathways to exploitation. Identify local and regional the contributing factors—physical conditions, social attitudes, pop culture, and community norms that either contribute to the problem or help to sustain it.
 - e. Analyze the role of technology in engaging against human trafficking.
 - f. Analyze the role of social media in the promotion of and engagement against human trafficking.
 - g. Examine the nexus between human trafficking and the military in the San Diego/Tijuana region.
 - h. Analyze the cost to society of rescuing (supportive services) versus not rescuing the victim. Cost of jail time, foster care, food stamps, crimes committed (i.e. drugs, breaking and entering, robbery), health of community, etc. (Example: to keep a person in state prison cost approx. \$37,000 per year versus \$17,000 to put through a drug and alcohol program, life-skills training, and job-training, so there is no need for foster care, food stamps, welfare, etc.)
 - i. Analyze correlations and connections between CSEC and school performance, dropout, truancy, gangs, Internet, sexting, alcohol and drug usage, runaways, child abuse, etc.

- j. Identify effective treatment models, as well as measure the impacts of intervention and prevention strategies.
- k. Develop a perpetrator profile (traffickers *and other related perpetrators*) in order to better prevent and identify perpetrators.
- l. Create a psycho-social evaluation of traffickers (in order to find a way to increase their buy-in and empathy with victims).
- m. Collect and analyze data obtained from 'john' sweeps and Prostitution Impact Panel (i.e. 'john school') to identify characteristics of consumers and predictors of recidivism.
- n. Assess the nature of indoctrination—traumatic bonding, grooming, and psychological manipulation.
- o. Research current laws and policies in place and proposed legislation.
- p. Understand binational and international factors and impacts.

Appendix A: Summit Action Planning and Recommendations Process

The recommendations in this report were inspired by the recommendations of the Summit participants. The summit process was designed to engage 250 key stakeholders to:

- Create a comprehensive, integrated response to human trafficking in San Diego County;
- Identify what works, what does not work, as well as identify barriers and solutions;
- Expose the different issues and challenges across the county within each sector and between sectors; and
- Facilitate cross-fertilization of knowledge, needs, opportunities for action between ‘boots on the ground’ and management, as well as across sectors.

Summit participants engaged in small sector-specific and cross-sector group discussions over the course of one day. Each group was asked to identify and prioritize problems, barriers, and solutions. After the Summit, Strategic Applications International combined all solutions into a single list. Summit participants were asked to complete an online survey ranking each solution in terms of importance and feasibility.

The Advisory Council took the top-ranked recommendations and worked, as Sub-Committees, to identify the steps, people, and timelines necessary to implement the recommendations. A comprehensive action-plan for implementing the recommendations in this report will be made available soon.

This report, therefore, reflects the composite recommendations of the Advisory Council. Sector-specific recommendations have been vetted by experts within the given sector, and reviewed by the Executive Committee. The recommendations do not reflect the recommendations of a particular organization or individual in the Advisory Council. In authoring this report, however, the Advisory Council has taken great care to ensure that the recommendations honor the expertise and advice of the Summit participants and Advisory Council members.

Appendix B: San Diego County Regional Human Trafficking and CSEC Advisory Council Members and Sub-Committee Chairs

Chair: Jenée Littrell, Grossmont Union High School District

Vice Chair: Mary Ellen Barrett, San Diego County District Attorney's Office

Sub-Committee Chairs:

Child Welfare

- **Chair:** Fran Cooper, Polinsky Children's Center
- **Vice Chair:** Charisma De Los Reyes, Child Welfare Services

Community

- **Co-Chair:** Ginger Shaw, California Against Slavery
- **Co-Chair:** Rachele Kimberling

Education

- **Co-Chair:** Jenée Littrell, Grossmont Union High School District
- **Co-Chair:** Mara Madrigal-Weiss, San Diego County Office of Education

Law Enforcement

- **Co-Chair:** Christina Bavencoff, San Diego County Sheriff's Department
- **Co-Chair:** Chris Cameron, San Diego Police Department
- **Former Chair:** Art Wager, San Diego Sheriff's Department

Prosecution

- **Chair:** Summer Stephan, San Diego County District Attorney's Office
- **Vice Chair:** Jamie Ledezma, San Diego City Attorney's Office

Research and Data

- **Co-Chair:** Ami Carpenter, PhD, University of San Diego
- **Co-Chair:** Jamie Gates, PhD, Point Loma Nazarene University

Victim Services

- **Co-Chair:** Verna Griffin-Tabor, Center for Community Solutions
- **Co-Chair:** Susan Munsey, Generate Hope

Additional Advisory Council Members:

- Autumn Burris, Survivors for Solutions
- Rabbi Laurie Coskey, Interfaith Committee for Worker Justice
- Kathi Hardy, Freedom from Exploitation
- Juan Jacobo, Department of Homeland Security
- Maryann Kotter, Primary Public Defender's Office
- Laura McLean, San Diego Youth Services STARS Program
- Tyra Myles, San Diego Probation Department
- Susan Thomson Tschirn, Human Rights Commission
- Alma Tucker, Red Binacional de Corazones
- Marisa Ugarte, Bilateral Safety Corridor Coalition

Coordinator- Carina Hinton